

Course for MA Programme in Philosophy

**PHIL5551 Topics in Comparative Philosophy:  
Chinese Philosophy from a Comparative Perspective**

(比較哲學專題: 從比較哲學觀點看中國哲學)

Date: Saturday Time: 14:30 – 17:30 Venue: YIA LT8

**Instructor**

Yiu-ming Fung 馮耀明

Emeritus Professor, Hong Kong University of Science & Technology

E-mail: [hmymfung@ust.hk](mailto:hmymfung@ust.hk)

Contact Hours: by appointment

**Medium of Instruction:** Cantonese (for Q&A, Putonghua and English also available)

**Course Description**

This course is a critical and comparative study of Chinese philosophy with emphasis on analytic methods. It aims at providing students with the basic training of how to use analytic methods, such as logical analysis, linguistic and conceptual analysis, in dealing with the main issues in Chinese philosophy, including philosophical problems in Confucianism, Daoism, Buddhism and other schools.

這是一門以分析方法和比較研究的角度來探討中國哲學問題的課目。其目的在訓練同學使用分析哲學的方法 (包括邏輯分析與語言概念分析的方法)，以處理中國哲學的問題，包括儒家、道家、佛家及其他思想學派的哲學問題。

**Course Objectives**

Through a comparative study of Chinese and Western philosophy, students are expected to have a deep understanding of the characteristics of both philosophical traditions, including their sameness and difference. This may be helpful for students to explore their philosophical horizon, to be able to use analytic methods to deal with problems in Chinese philosophy, and to investigate the deep level of meaning in Chinese thought.

透過中西哲學的比較研究，同學可更深入理解中西兩大哲學傳統之特性及異同，從而拓寬其哲學視野，有助同學運用西方哲學的分析方法去處理中國哲學的問題，及發掘中國哲學思想之深層意義。

## **Course Outline**

**B** Background Readings

**R** Required Readings

### **Topic 1 Mental vs. Non-mental Reading of Confucius' Idea of *Ren* (Benevolence)**

(孔子的「仁」之心靈與非心靈的不同解讀)

**Readings:** Herbert Fingarette, *Confucius: The Secular as Sacred* (Chapter 1: The Locus of the Personal) **B**

Yiu-ming Fung, Disposition or Imposition? **R**

馮耀明：論語中仁與禮關係新詮

Yiu-ming Fung, *Ren as a Heavy Concept in the Analects* **R**

### **Topic 2 Reason and Feeling in Confucianism**

(儒家的理性與感情)

**Readings:** Colin McGinn, *Philosophical Provocations* (p. 19-20) **B**

Yiu-ming Fung, Moral Feeling and Moral Dilemma in Confucianism **R**

### **Topic 3 Baptized Naming and Rectifying Names in Confucianism**

(儒家的受浸命名與正名)

**Readings:** John Searle, *Social Ontology & Philosophy of Society* **B**

John Searle, What Is an Institution **B**

Yiu-ming Fung, Naming and Rectifying Names in Confucianism **R**

### **Topic 4 Cognitive vs. Non-cognitive Reading of Wang Yangming's *Liang-zhi***

(王陽明的「良知」之認知與非認知的不同解讀)

**Readings:** 陳來：《有無之境》(Chapter 7) **B**

Wang Yangming (Wang Shou-Jen) from *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*  
Yiu-ming Fung, Wang Yang-ming's Theory of *Liang-zhi* <sup>R</sup>  
馮耀明：王陽明良知學新詮

### **Topic 5 Two Kinds of Ineffability in Daoism**

(道家的兩種「不可言說」)

**Readings:** Yiu-ming Fung, Two Kinds of Ineffability in Daoism <sup>R</sup>

Yiu-ming Fung, Zhuangzi's Idea of Oneness <sup>B</sup>

### **Topic 6 The Very Idea of “True Contradiction” in Chinese Philosophy**

(中國哲學中的所謂「真矛盾」的思想)

**Readings:** Priest, Graham, Francesco Berto, and Zach Weber (2022). “Dialetheism,”

*The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* <sup>B</sup>

Yiu-ming Fung, On the Very Idea of “True Contradiction” <sup>R</sup>

### **Topic 7 The Very Idea of Mass-stuff Semantics in Chinese Philosophy**

(中國哲學中的所謂「物質材質語意學」的思想)

**Readings:** Chad Hansen, *Language and Logic in Ancient China* (Chapters 1-2) <sup>B</sup>

Yiu-ming Fung, The Myth of Mass-stuff Semantics in Ancient China <sup>R</sup>

### **Topic 8 Logical Analysis of the Thesis of “White-horse Is Not Horse”**

(「白馬非馬」論之邏輯分斯)

**Readings:** Chad Hansen, Mass Nouns and “A White Horse Is Not a Horse” <sup>B</sup>

方萬全：論陳漢生的物質名詞假設

Yiu-ming Fung, A Logical Analysis of the White-Horse Dialogue <sup>R</sup>

### **Topic 9 How to Do Zen (Chan) with Words?**

(如何用語言做禪 [的工夫])

**Readings:** Henry Rosemont, Jr., The Meaning Is the Use: Kooan and Mondoo as

Linguistic Tools of the Zen Masters <sup>B</sup>

Yiu-ming Fung: How to Do Zen with Words? <sup>R</sup>

John Searle: Reply to Yiu-ming Fung

**Additional Topic :**

**On the Very Idea of Correlative Thinking in Chinese Philosophy**

(中國哲學中的所謂關聯思考)

**Readings:** Joseph Needham, *Science and Civilisation in China*, Vol: 2: *History of Scientific Thought* (p. 279-303) <sup>B</sup>

A. C. Graham, *Disputers of the Tao: Philosophical Argument in Ancient China* (Chinese Translation: p. 364-406) <sup>B</sup>

Yiu-ming Fung, On the Very Idea of “Correlative Thinking” <sup>R</sup>

**Requirements and Grading**

- (1) Regular Attendance and Discussion
- (2) Mid-term Short Essay (Academic Paper or Book Report): 30%
- (3) Final-term Academic Paper: 70%

**General References**

- (1) Yiu-ming Fung, *Language, Truth and Logic in Ancient China* (Book Manuscript)
- (2) A. C. Graham, *Later Mohist Logic, Ethics and Science* (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press, 1978)
- (3) A. C. Graham, *Disputers of the Tao: Philosophical Argument in Ancient China* (La Salle, Illinois: Open Court, 1989)
- (4) A. C. Graham, *Chuang Tzu: The Inner Chapters* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 2001)

- (5) Chad Hansen, *Language and Logic in Ancient China* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1983)
- (6) Chad Hansen, *A Daoist Theory of Chinese Thought: A Philosophical Interpretation* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992)
- (7) Christoph Harbsmeier, *Science and Civilisation in China, vol. 7, part 1, Language and Logic in China* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998)
- (8) Joseph Needham, *Science and Civilisation in China, volume II, History of Scientific Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1956)
- (9) 方萬全：〈論陳漢生的物質名詞假設〉，葉錦明編《邏輯思想與語言哲學》(台北：學生書局 1997)，頁 201-222。
- (10) 方萬全：〈真理概念與先秦哲學〉《南京大學學報》，2006 年第二期，頁 91-102。
- (11) 馮耀明：《公孫龍子》(台北：東大圖書公司 2000)。
- (12) Yiu-ming Fung (ed.), *Dao Companion to Chinese Philosophy of Logic* (Dordrecht: Springer 2020)。
- (13) 馮友蘭：《中國哲學史》(上海：商務印書館 1934)。
- (14) 沈有鼎：《墨經的邏輯學》(北京：中國社會科學出版社 1980)。
- (15) 沈有鼎：《沈有鼎文集》(北京：人民出版社 1992)。